

Subcommittee on Duties of Elected Officials
Staff Report on Personnel Director by James W. Ingram III

Table 1: Comparative Analysis of the Personnel Director in Large California Cities

City	Pop'n, 2005	Form of Governme nt	Top Civil Service Official	Elected or Appointed	Removal Process/Term	Officer Reports to:
Los Angeles	3,844,829	Strong Mayor- Council	Personnel Director	Appointed by Mayor with Council Confirmation	The Mayor may remove without Council approval; Removals may be appealed to Council w/in 10 days of removal; Council may act w/in 10 days to reinstate by two-thirds vote.	Mayor evaluates the officer annually.
San Diego	1,266,753 ¹	Strong Mayor- Council	Personnel Director	Appointed by Civil Service Commission (CSC) (Sec 37).	None specified; likely, the CSC would have removal authority over this officer. Section 30 states: "Officers and employees in the unclassified service appointed by the Manager or other appointing authority not under control of the Manager may be removed by such appointing authority at any time."	Manager (Mayor under Article XV) and CSC; acts as Chief Examiner subject to CSC (Sec 116).
San Jose	912,332	Council- Manager (weak)	City Manager; city has no Personnel	Manager is nominated by Mayor and	Manager serves at pleasure of Council, but may be recalled by	Both the Manager and the CSC report to the Council.

¹ The 2003 U.S. Census projection was used for this figure; an accurate figure for 2005 was unavailable.

		mayor)	Director, but its Civil Service Commission (CSC) serves in rule-making and appellate roles. Charter specifies: "the head of any personnel department of the City shall not hold any secretarial, executive or administrative position under the direct jurisdiction of the Civil Service Commission" Section 1001(e).	confirmed by Council for an indefinite term (Secs 700, 702, 703, 1604). CSC has 5 members serving 4-year terms, appointed by the Council; no more than 4 may be of the same sex; one member must be an attorney (Sec 1001).	voters. CSC members serve for a term, and no removal process is specified.	
San Francisco	739,426	Strong Mayor-County Board of Supervisors (BOS) ²	Human Resources Director (HRD); Civil Service Commission (CSC) to handle appeals.	The CSC nominates an HRD, the Mayor appoints from among these nominees, subject to BOS confirmation (Sec 10.103). CSC consists of 5 appointees, at least 2 must be	Human Resources Director serves at pleasure of Mayor, but removal may be overridden by 4/5 vote of CSC within 30 days (Sec 10.103). CSC members may only be removed on charges in the same way as City elected officers (Sec 10.100). CSC members	Human Resources Director reports to Mayor and to CSC, which can also direct officer's work. Mayor must work with this officer or CSC in terms of civil service rather than directly being involved (Sec

² San Francisco is a consolidated city-county, and thus the County Board of Supervisors is the legislative body.

				women, serving 6-year terms (Sec 10.100). Mayor appoints CSC members, unless they are rejected by a 2/3 vote of the BOS within 30 days (Sec 3.100(17)).	may only be removed under the Ethics Commission process the charter establishes for elected officials (Sec 15.105).	10.102).
Long Beach	474,014	Council-Manager (weak mayor)	Executive Director of Civil Service Commission (EDCSC).	CSC appoints the EDCSC (Sec 1101f). CSC is 5-member body of city residents (Sec 1100), appointed by Mayor to staggered 4-year terms, subject to confirmation by Council majority (Sec 508, 509).	The Charter does not specify a removal process for the EDCSC. Sec 116 of the CSC's Rules and Regulations indicates that the EDCSC serves at pleasure of the CSC (http://www.longbeach.gov/civica/filebank/blobdownload.asp?BlobID=3915). Council majority may remove CSC members, but only for cause (Sec 510).	EDCSC reports to CSC, as per CSC Rules and Regulations Sec 117 (http://www.longbeach.gov/civica/filebank/blobdownload.asp?BlobID=3916).
Fresno	461,116	Strong Mayor-Council	Director of Personnel Services (DPS); Civil Service Board (CSB).	CSB appointed by Mayor with Council approval from City's qualified electors holding no paid position in City government. The 5 board members serve staggered 4-year terms (Sec 902). No CSB member	CSB members may be removed by Council motion adopted by at least five affirmative votes; Council contains 7 members (Sec 902). CAO may remove the DPS (Sec 1000(a1) and DPS job description (150042)).	CSB serves at Council pleasure. DPS serves at pleasure of the CAO (Sec 1000(a1) and DPS job description (150042)).

				may work for city until one year after leaving CSB (Sec 908). Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) appoints DPS (Sec 1000(a1) and DPS job description (150042)).		
Sacramento	456,441	Council-Manager (weak mayor)	Director of Personnel (DOP), serving as Secretary of Civil Service Board (CSB)	DOP is appointed by City Manager (Sec 81); City Council appoints to CSB 5 citizens without connection to city government to serve for 5-year terms (Sec 80).	No removal process specified for DOP (Sec 81). CSB members may only be removed as provided by law (Sec 80).	DOP serves as Secretary of CSB, and follows its direction (Sec 81). However, the officer obviously has a reporting relationship with the City Manager as appointing authority. CSB reports to Council.
Oakland	395,274	Strong Mayor-Council	Civil Service Board (CSB); Personnel Director (PD).	Mayor appoints CSB members, subject to confirmation by the affirmative vote of 5 of the 8 Council members (Sec 601). City Administrator (CA) appoints PD Municipal Code (MC) Sec 2.08.020).	CSB members may be removed for cause, after hearing, by the affirmative vote of at least 6 of the 8 Council members (Sec 601). CA may remove PD (Sec 902c and MC Sec 2.08.020).	CSB administers system created by ordinance of Mayor and Council (Sec 904). PD reports to CA (MC Sec 2.08.020).

Santa Ana	340,368	Council-Manager (weak mayor)	Personnel Board (PB); Executive Director of Personnel Services (EDPS).	Council majority appoints PB's 7 members to staggered, 4-year terms (Sec 901, 911). The City Manager (CM) appoints EDPS (Municipal Code (MC) Sec 9-4).	PB members are removed by Council majority, but only for cause, as defined by ordinance (Sec 901, 911). The EDPS serves at the pleasure of the CM; the CM may replace this officer at will (MC Sec 9-4).	The PB reports to Council; PB acts as an appeals body, as is typical. As such, its actions are affected by state law. The EDPS may be directed to serve as PB's Secretary, if CM desires, but EDPS reports to CM (MC Sec 9-4).
Anaheim	331,804	Council-Manager (weak mayor)	Human Resources Director (HRD)	The HRD is appointed by the City Council (Municipal Code (MC) Sec 1.05.020.010).	Neither the Charter nor the Municipal Code provides a removal process for the HRD.	HRD acts subject to direction of the City Manager (MC Sec 1.05.020.010).
Bakersfield	295,536	Council-Manager (weak mayor)	Civil Service Board (CSB); City Manager is designated as Personnel Director (Municipal Code Sec 2.72.040). (Note that a separate civil service system is provided for the Police Department.)	CSB consists of 5 city residents unconnected to city government appointed by Council for staggered 3-year terms (Sec 209). The Council appoints the City Manager (Sec 34).	CSB Members are removed from office in the same manner as are elective officers or by unanimous vote of Council members allowed by law to vote (Mayor may not vote in this instance because this officer may only vote to break ties on the 4-member Council) (Sec 209). The City Manager serves a term at pleasure of Council, but may be removed by 4 Council votes, with 30-day appeal rights (Sec 37.5).	CSB acts subject to Council approval (Sec 209). The City Manager reports to the Council (Sec 36).

Riverside	290,086	Council-Manager (weak mayor)	Human Resources Director (HRD); Human Resources Board (HRB) acts on appeals (MC Sec 2.36.030).	The City Manager appoints the HRD (Municipal Code Section 2.36.020). HRB consists of 9 members appointed by Council (MC Sec 2.36.030).	The City Manager may remove the HRD (Municipal Code Section 2.36.020). Neither the Charter nor Municipal Code provides a removal process for the HRB).	The HRD reports to the City Manager (Municipal Code Section 2.36.020). The HRB reports to the Council (MC Sec 2.36.030).
Stockton	286,926	Council-manager (weak mayor)	Chief Examiner (CE) of the Civil Service Commission (CSC)	Council appoints 5 citizen residents without any other city position to staggered 3-year terms on the CSC (Sec 2502). The CSC appoints the City Clerk or one of the officer's deputies to act as CE (Sec 2503).	Council may remove CSC members for cause after a public hearing (Sec 2502). CE serves at the pleasure of the CSC (Sec 2503).	CE reports to CSC, and CSC reports to Council (Secs. 2502 and 2503)

Both Table 1 and Table 2 were assembled based on a search of the city charters, administrative & municipal codes, and official city websites for all cities included.

Table 2: Comparative Analysis of the Personnel Director in Large Strong Mayor Cities³

City	Pop'n, 2005	Form of Governme nt	Top Civil Service Official	Elected or Appointed	Removal Process/Term	Officer Reports to:
New York City	8,213,839	Strong Mayor- Council	Commissioner of Department of Citywide Administrative Services (Chapter 35, Sec 810).	Appointed by Mayor without confirmation (Sec 385).	Serves at pleasure; may be removed by the Mayor.	Appeals are heard by an appointed Civil Service Commission, consisting of 5 members appointed by mayor to staggered 6-year terms (no more than 3 of any political party) (Sec 813). Commissioner reports quarterly to Mayor, Council, CSC and EEOC (Sec 814).
Philadelphia	1,463,281	Strong Mayor- Council	Personnel Director	Appointed by the Civil Service Commission, whose 3 members are appointed by Mayor to staggered 6-year terms (removal process unclear). (See 3-205 vs. 3-804)	Personnel Director serves at pleasure until replaced by successor. (See 3- 404).	Reports on status of Civil Service to Commission and to Mayor.

³ These cities have been classified as strong mayor cities by Craig Wheeland in the article, "An Institutional Perspective on Mayoral Leadership: Linking Leadership Style to Formal Structure," *National Civic Review*, Volume 91, Number 1, Spring 2002, pp. 25-39. See Table 2. Wheeland offers the most complete analysis of the nation's 40 largest cities.

